# Some results on the convexity of the closure of the domain of a maximally monotone operator

Jonathan M. Borwein<sup>\*</sup> and Liangjin Yao<sup>†</sup>

May 16, evening, 2012

#### Abstract

We provide a concise analysis about what is known regarding when the closure of the domain of a maximally monotone operator on an arbitrary real Banach space is convex. In doing so, we also provide an affirmative answer to a problem posed by Simons.

### 2010 Mathematics Subject Classification:

Primary 47H05; Secondary 26B25,47A05, 47B65.

**Keywords:** Nearly convex set, Fitzpatrick function, maximally monotone operator, monotone operator, set-valued operator.

## 1 Introduction

As discussed in [3, 4, 5, 6], the two most central open questions in monotone operator theory are probably in a general real Banach space whether (i) the sum of two maximally monotone operators A+B is maximally monotone under *Rockafellar's constraint qualification* dom  $A \cap$  int dom  $B \neq \emptyset$  [12]; and whether (ii) dom A is always convex. Rockafellar showed that dom A is convex if int dom  $A \neq \emptyset$  [11].

Since a positive answer to various restricted versions of (i) implies a positive answer to (ii) [6, 16], we have determined to make what progress we may with the later question.

<sup>\*</sup>CARMA, University of Newcastle, Newcastle, New South Wales 2308, Australia. E-mail: jonathan.borwein@newcastle.edu.au. Distinguished Professor King Abdulaziz University, Jeddah.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>†</sup>CARMA, University of Newcastle, Newcastle, New South Wales 2308, Australia. E-mail: liangjin.yao@newcastle.edu.au.

## **1.1** Preliminary matters

Throughout this note, we assume that X is a general real Banach space with norm  $\|\cdot\|$ , that  $X^*$  is its continuous dual space, and that  $\langle \cdot, \cdot \rangle$  denotes the usual pairing between these spaces. Let  $A: X \rightrightarrows X^*$  be a *set-valued operator* (also known as multifunction) from X to  $X^*$ , i.e., for every  $x \in X$ ,  $Ax \subseteq X^*$ , and let  $\operatorname{gra} A = \{(x, x^*) \in X \times X^* \mid x^* \in Ax\}$  be the graph of A. Then A is said to be monotone if

(1) 
$$(\forall (x, x^*) \in \operatorname{gra} A) (\forall (y, y^*) \in \operatorname{gra} A) \quad \langle x - y, x^* - y^* \rangle \ge 0,$$

and maximally monotone if no proper enlargement (in the sense of graph inclusion) of A is monotone. We say  $(x, x^*)$  is monotonically related to gra A if

$$\langle x - y, x^* - y^* \rangle \ge 0, \quad \forall (y, y^*) \in \operatorname{gra} A.$$

Let  $A: X \rightrightarrows X^*$  be such that gra  $A \neq \emptyset$ . The *Fitzpatrick function* associated with A [8] is defined by

$$F_A \colon X \times X^* \to ]-\infty, +\infty] \colon (x, x^*) \mapsto \sup_{(a, a^*) \in \operatorname{gra} A} \left( \langle x, a^* \rangle + \langle a, x^* \rangle - \langle a, a^* \rangle \right).$$

Monotone operators have proven to be a key class of objects in modern Optimization and Analysis; see, e.g., the books [2, 6, 7, 10, 14, 16, 13, 26, 27, 28] and the references therein.

Throughout, we adopt standard convex analysis notation. Given a subset C of X, int C is the *interior* of C,  $\overline{C}$  is the norm closure of C, and conv C is the convex hull of C. The *indicator function* of C, written as  $\iota_C$ , is defined at  $x \in X$  by

(2) 
$$\iota_C(x) = \begin{cases} 0, & \text{if } x \in C; \\ +\infty, & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases}$$

The distance function to the set C, written as dist $(\cdot, C)$ , is defined by  $x \mapsto \inf_{c \in C} ||x - c||$ . For every  $x \in X$ , the normal cone operator of C at x is defined by  $N_C(x) = \{x^* \in X^* | \sup_{c \in C} \langle c - x, x^* \rangle \leq 0\}$ , if  $x \in C$ ; and  $N_C(x) := \emptyset$ , if  $x \notin C$ .

We also say a set C is *nearly convex* if  $\overline{C}$  is convex.

Let  $f: X \to ]-\infty, +\infty]$ . Then dom  $f = f^{-1}(\mathbb{R})$  is the *domain* of f, and  $f^*: X^* \to [-\infty, +\infty]: x^* \mapsto \sup_{x \in X} (\langle x, x^* \rangle - f(x))$  is the *Fenchel conjugate* of f. We say f is proper if dom  $f \neq \emptyset$ . Let f be proper. The subdifferential of f is defined by

$$\partial f \colon X \rightrightarrows X^* \colon x \mapsto \{x^* \in X^* \mid (\forall y \in X) \ \langle y - x, x^* \rangle + f(x) \le f(y)\}.$$

Let Y be another real Banach space. We denote  $P_X : X \times Y \to X : (x, y) \mapsto x$  and  $\mathbb{N} := \{1, 2, 3, \ldots\}.$ 

The paper is organized as follows. In Section 2, we collect auxiliary results for future reference and for the reader's convenience.

In Section 3, we first present an efficient sufficient condition for the closure of the domain of a maximally monotone operator A to be convex in Theorem 3.3. To the best of our knowledge, this recaptures and extends all known general conditions for dom A to be nearly convex. We then turn to our main result (Theorem 3.6) which provides an affirmative answer to a problem posed by Simons in [16, Problem 28.3, page 112].

Let  $A: X \rightrightarrows X^*$  be maximally monotone. Is it necessarily true that

$$\overline{P_X\left[\operatorname{dom} F_A\right]} = \overline{\operatorname{conv}\left[\operatorname{dom} A\right]} ?$$

Simons[15], showed the answer is yes under the constraint that int dom  $A \neq \emptyset$ . (This is also an immediate consequence of Corollary 3.4 below.)

## 2 Auxiliary Results

The basic building blocks we appeal to are as follows. We first record Fitzpatrick's result connecting A to the corresponding Fitzpatrick function.

**Fact 2.1 (Fitzpatrick)** (See [8, Proposition 3.2, Theorem 3.4 and Corollary 3.9].) Let  $A: X \rightrightarrows X^*$  be monotone with dom  $A \neq \emptyset$ . Then  $F_A$  is proper lower semicontinuous, convex and  $F_A = \langle \cdot, \cdot \rangle$  on gra A. Moreover, if A is maximally monotone, for every  $(x, x^*) \in X \times X^*$ , the inequality

 $\langle x, x^* \rangle \le F_A(x, x^*)$ 

is true, and equality holds if and only if  $(x, x^*) \in \operatorname{gra} A$ .

We turn to two technical results of Simons that we shall exploit.

**Fact 2.2 (Simons)** (See [16, Lemma 19.18].) Let  $A : X \rightrightarrows X^*$  be monotone with gra  $A \neq \emptyset$ and  $(z, z^*) \in \text{dom } F_A$ . Let  $F : \text{gra } A \to \mathbb{R}$  be such that  $\inf F > 0$ . Then there exists  $r \in \mathbb{R}$ such that

$$\frac{\langle z-a, z^*-a^* \rangle}{F(a, a^*)} \ge r, \quad \forall (a, a^*) \in \operatorname{gra} A.$$

**Fact 2.3 (Simons)** (See [16, Thereom 27.5].) Let  $A : X \rightrightarrows X^*$  be monotone. Assume the implication that

$$z \notin \overline{\operatorname{dom} A} \quad \Rightarrow \quad \sup_{(a,a^*)\in \operatorname{gra} A} \frac{\langle z-a,a^* \rangle}{\|z-a\|} = +\infty$$

holds. Then

$$\overline{\operatorname{dom} A} = \overline{\operatorname{conv} \left[\operatorname{dom} A\right]} = \overline{P_X \left[\operatorname{dom} F_A\right]},$$

and hence dom A is nearly convex:  $\overline{\text{dom }A}$  is convex, since  $P_X[\text{dom }F_A]$  is the projection of a convex set.

Let us recall two definitions:

**Definition 2.4 ((FPV) and (BR))** Let  $A : X \rightrightarrows X^*$  be maximally monotone. We say A is type Fitzpatrick-Phelps-Veronas (FPV) if for every open convex set  $U \subseteq X$  such that  $U \cap \text{dom } A \neq \emptyset$ , the implication

 $x \in U$  and  $(x, x^*)$  is monotonically related to  $\operatorname{gra} A \cap (U \times X^*) \Rightarrow (x, x^*) \in \operatorname{gra} A$ 

holds.

We say A is of of "Brønsted-Rockafellar" (BR) type [17] if whenever  $(x, x^*) \in X \times X^*$ ,  $\alpha, \beta > 0$  while

$$\inf_{(a,a^*)\in \operatorname{gra} A} \langle x-a, x^*-a^* \rangle > -\alpha\beta$$

then there exists  $(b, b^*) \in \operatorname{gra} A$  such that  $||x - b|| < \alpha, ||x^* - b^*|| < \beta$ .

Note that if  $\leq$  is used throughout we get a nominally slightly stronger property [19]. We also remark that unlike most properties studied for monotone operators (BR) is an isometric property not a priori preserved under Banach space isomorphism [1].

Likewise in [18, 19] a notion of Verona regularity of a maximally monotone operator A is introduced and studied. In [21, Theorems 1&2] it is shown that A is Verona regular, if and only if, A + M is maximally monotone whenever M is maximally monotone and has bounded range, if and only if,  $A + \lambda \partial || \cdot -x ||$  is maximally monotone for all  $\lambda > 0, x \in X$ .

We finish this section with a result on linear mappings.

**Fact 2.5** (See [25, Corollary 3.3].) Let  $A : X \Rightarrow X^*$  be a maximally monotone linear relation, and  $f : X \to ]-\infty, +\infty]$  be a proper lower semicontinuous convex function with dom  $A \cap \operatorname{int} \operatorname{dom} \partial f \neq \emptyset$ . Then  $A + \partial f$  is of type (FPV). In particular A is of type (FPV).

# 3 Domain near convexity

A useful general criterion for (4) to hold is the following result abstracted from [19]. Let us denote  $J_p := \frac{1}{p} \partial \| \cdot \|^p$ . Thus,  $J_2 = J$  is the classical duality map, while  $J_1$  is a maximally monotone operator with bounded range.

**Proposition 3.1** Let  $1 \le p < \infty$  be given. Suppose that A is monotone and that for all  $z \notin \overline{\text{dom } A}$  and all sufficiently large  $\lambda > 0$ 

(3) 
$$(z,0)$$
 is not monotonically related to gra  $(A + \lambda J_p(\cdot - z))$ .

Then

(4) 
$$\overline{\operatorname{dom} A} = \overline{\operatorname{conv} [\operatorname{dom} A]} = \overline{P_X [\operatorname{dom} F_A]},$$

and in particular dom A is nearly convex.

*Proof.* Let  $z \in X$  be such that

(5) 
$$z \notin \operatorname{dom} A$$

We have  $\alpha := \operatorname{dist}(z, \operatorname{\overline{dom}} A) > 0$ . Since (z, 0) is not monotonically related to gra  $(A + \lambda J_p(-z + \cdot))$ , there exist  $(a_\lambda, a_\lambda^*) \in \operatorname{gra} A$  and  $b_\lambda^* \in J_p(-z + a_\lambda)$  such that

$$\begin{split} &\langle z - a_{\lambda}, a_{\lambda}^{*} + \lambda b_{\lambda}^{*} \rangle > 0 \\ \Rightarrow &\langle z - a_{\lambda}, a_{\lambda}^{*} \rangle > \lambda \langle -z + a_{\lambda}, b_{\lambda}^{*} \rangle \\ \Rightarrow &\langle z - a_{\lambda}, a_{\lambda}^{*} \rangle > \lambda \| - z + a_{\lambda} \|^{p} \quad (\text{by } b_{\lambda}^{*} \in J_{p}(-z + a_{\lambda})) \\ \Rightarrow &\frac{\langle z - a_{\lambda}, a_{\lambda}^{*} \rangle}{\| - z + a_{\lambda} \|} > \lambda \| - z + a_{\lambda} \|^{p-1} \quad (\text{since } \| - z + a_{\lambda} \| \ge \alpha > 0) \\ \Rightarrow &\frac{\langle z - a_{\lambda}, a_{\lambda}^{*} \rangle}{\| - z + a_{\lambda} \|} > \lambda \alpha^{p-1} \quad (\text{by } \| - z + a_{\lambda} \| \ge \alpha) \\ \Rightarrow &\sup_{\lambda} \frac{\langle z - a_{\lambda}, a_{\lambda}^{*} \rangle}{\| z - a_{\lambda} \|} = +\infty. \end{split}$$

By Fact 2.3,  $\overline{\text{dom }A} = \overline{\text{conv} [\text{dom }A]} = \overline{P_X [\text{dom }F_A]}$ . Hence  $\overline{\text{dom }A}$  is convex.

We also provide a (potentially) weaker criterion for equality of  $\overline{\text{conv}[\text{dom }A]} = \overline{P_X[\text{dom }F_A]}$  for a monotone operator.

**Proposition 3.2** Let  $A: X \rightrightarrows X^*$  be monotone. Assume the implication that

(6) 
$$z \notin \overline{\operatorname{conv} [\operatorname{dom} A]} \Rightarrow \sup_{(a,a^*)\in \operatorname{gra} A} \frac{\langle z-a, a^* \rangle}{\|z-a\|} = +\infty$$

holds. Then

$$\overline{\operatorname{conv}\left[\operatorname{dom} A\right]} = \overline{P_X\left[\operatorname{dom} F_A\right]}$$

*Proof.* By Fact 2.1, conv  $[\operatorname{dom} A] \subseteq P_X [\operatorname{dom} F_A]$  and thus  $\operatorname{conv} [\operatorname{dom} A] \subseteq \overline{P_X [\operatorname{dom} F_A]}$ . It suffices to show that

(7)  $P_X [\operatorname{dom} F_A] \subseteq \overline{\operatorname{conv} [\operatorname{dom} A]}.$ 

Suppose to the contrary that there exists  $(z, z^*) \in \text{dom } F_A$  such that  $z \notin \text{conv}[\text{dom } A]$ . Define  $F : \text{gra } A : (a, a^*) \mapsto ||z - a||$ . We have  $\inf F = \text{dist}(z, \text{dom } A) > 0$ . Then by Fact 2.2, there exists  $r \in \mathbb{R}$  such that for every  $(a, a^*) \in \text{gra } A$ ,

$$||z^*|| - \frac{\langle z - a, a^* \rangle}{||z - a||} \ge \frac{\langle z - a, z^* \rangle}{||z - a||} - \frac{\langle z - a, a^* \rangle}{||z - a||} = \frac{\langle z - a, z^* - a^* \rangle}{||z - a||} \ge r.$$

Then we have

$$\sup_{(a,a^*)\in \operatorname{gra} A} \frac{\langle z-a,a^*\rangle}{\|z-a\|} \le \|z^*\| - r < +\infty, \text{ which contradicts (6).}$$

Hence (7) holds.

The proof of Proposition 3.2 above follows closely that of [16, Thereom 27.5].

We now turn to our synthesis of known results.

**Theorem 3.3 (Domain near convexity)** Let  $A : X \Rightarrow X^*$  be monotone. Fix p with  $1 \le p < \infty$ .

(i) First suppose that for all  $z \notin \overline{\text{dom } A}$  and all sufficiently large  $\lambda > 0$ 

 $A + \lambda J_p(\cdot - z)$  is maximally monotone.

Then  $\operatorname{dom} A$  is nearly convex since

$$\overline{\operatorname{dom} A} = \overline{\operatorname{conv} \left[\operatorname{dom} A\right]} = \overline{P_X \left[\operatorname{dom} F_A\right]}.$$

(ii) If we only suppose that for all  $z \notin \overline{\text{conv}[\text{dom } A]}$  and all sufficiently large  $\lambda > 0$ 

(z, 0) is not monotonically related to gra  $(A + \lambda J_p(\cdot - z))$ .

Then

$$\overline{\operatorname{conv}\left[\operatorname{dom} A\right]} = \overline{P_X\left[\operatorname{dom} F_A\right]}$$

Proof. Part (i). Suppose  $z \notin \overline{\text{dom } A}$ . Then  $(z, 0) \notin \text{gra} (A + \lambda J_p(\cdot - z))$ . Since  $A + \lambda J_p(\cdot - z)$  is maximally monotone, (z, 0) cannot be monotonically related to  $\text{gra} (A + \lambda J_p(\cdot - z))$ . Then we may directly apply Proposition 3.1.

*Part (ii).* Suppose now that  $z \notin \overline{\text{conv}[\text{dom }A]}$ . We follow the lines of the proof of Proposition 3.1 to obtain  $\sup_{(a,a^*)\in \text{gra }A} \frac{\langle z-a,a^* \rangle}{\|z-a\|} = +\infty$ . We then apply Proposition 3.2 and obtain

$$\operatorname{conv}\left[\operatorname{dom} A\right] = \overline{P_X}\left[\operatorname{dom} F_A\right],$$

as asserted.

When A is maximally monotone, Part (i) of Theorem 3.3 recaptures a great many attractive cases.

**Corollary 3.4 (Conditions for near convexity)** Let  $A : X \rightrightarrows X^*$  be maximally monotone. Then  $\overline{\text{dom } A} = \overline{\text{conv}[\text{dom } A]} = \overline{P_X[\text{dom } F_A]}$  (and thus dom A is nearly convex) as soon as any of the following hold:

- (i) X is reflexive;
- (ii) A is Verona regular;
- (iii) A is of type (FPV); as holds if
- (iv) int dom  $A \neq \emptyset$ ; or if
- (v)  $\operatorname{gra} A$  is affine.

*Proof.* Part (i). First, in reflexive spaces, we have a Rockafellar's sum theorem implying that  $A + \lambda J_p(\cdot - z)$  is always maximally monotone for every  $z \in X$  since dom  $J_p(\cdot - z) = X$ , see [12, 16, 6]).

<u>Part</u> (ii). Next observe that setting p = 1 shows that Verona regular mappings imply dom  $A = \text{conv} [\text{dom } A] = P_X [\text{dom } F_A]$ , since as noted above the Veronas show the maximal monotonicity of  $A + \lambda J_1(\cdot - z)$  for all  $\lambda > 0, z \in X$  is equivalent to their definition.

*Part (iii).* Likewise, [23, Corollary 3.6] gives another proof that type (FPV) mappings have this property. Or see [16, Theorem 44.2], [24, Proposition 5.2.1, page 107].

Part (iv). This holds for various reasons. For instance it is shown in [4] that A is type (FPV). It also follows from the sum theorem in [4, Theorem 9.6.1] which applies to two maximally monotone operators A, B such that int dom  $A \cap$  int dom  $B \neq \emptyset$ , and so shows that the maximal monotonicity of  $A + \lambda J_p(\cdot - z)$  for all  $p \ge 1, \lambda > 0, z \in X$ .

Part (v). By Fact ([25, Theorem 3.1] or [23, Corollary 3.13], we have that A is type FPV and that  $A + \lambda J_p(\cdot - z)$  is maximally monotone for all  $\lambda > 0, z \in X$ . Then we directly apply Theorem 3.3. Or see [16, Theorem 46.1].

In both cases (ii) and (iii), it is still entirely possible that all maximally monotone operators have the desired property. The only other general conditions we know for near convexity are a relativization of Part (iv), namely,  ${}^{ic}(\operatorname{conv} \operatorname{dom} A) \neq \emptyset$  [22, Corollary 5] and the result below which follows directly from the definition of operators of type (BR):

**Proposition 3.5** Let  $A: X \rightrightarrows X^*$  be maximally monotone and  $(x, x^*) \in X \times X^*$ . Assume that A is of type (BR) and that  $\inf_{(a,a^*)\in \operatorname{gra} A}\langle x-a, x^*-a^*\rangle > -\infty$ . Then  $x \in \operatorname{\overline{dom} A}$  and  $x^* \in \operatorname{\overline{ran} A}$ . In particular,

$$\overline{\operatorname{dom} A} = \overline{P_X [\operatorname{dom} F_A]} \quad and \quad \overline{\operatorname{ran} A} = \overline{P_{X^*} [\operatorname{dom} F_A]}.$$

Consequently, both dom A and ran A are nearly convex.

*Proof.* By an easy argument, see [20, Lemma 1(a)&(b)] or [1, Fact 2.10], we have  $x \in \overline{\text{dom } A}$  and  $x^* \in \overline{\text{ran } A}$ .

We now show that  $\overline{\text{dom }A} = \overline{P_X [\text{dom }F_A]}$ . By Fact 2.1, it suffices to show that

(8) 
$$P_X [\operatorname{dom} F_A] \subseteq \overline{\operatorname{dom} A}.$$

Let  $(z, z^*) \in \text{dom } F_A$ . Then we have  $\inf_{(a,a^*)\in \text{gra } A}\langle x-a, x^*-a^*\rangle > -\infty$ . Hence  $z \in \overline{\text{dom } A}$ by the above result. Thus (8) holds and then  $\overline{\text{dom } A} = \overline{P_X [\text{dom } F_A]}$ . Similarly, we have  $\overline{\text{ran } A} = \overline{P_{X^*} [\text{dom } F_A]}$ . Hence dom A and ran A both are nearly convex.

Note the different flavour of Proposition 3.5 with its implications for near convexity of the range and domain. We recall also that all dense type (D) operators are of type (BR) (see [9, Theorem 1.4(4)]). A detailed analysis of (BR) and type (D) operators is made in [1].

We now come to our main new result.

**Theorem 3.6** Let  $A : X \rightrightarrows X^*$  be maximally monotone. Then

$$\overline{\operatorname{conv}\left[\operatorname{dom} A\right]} = \overline{P_X\left[\operatorname{dom} F_A\right]}.$$

*Proof.* By Fact 2.1, it suffices to show that

(9) 
$$P_X [\operatorname{dom} F_A] \subseteq \operatorname{\overline{conv}} [\operatorname{dom} A]$$

Let  $(z, z^*) \in \text{dom } F_A$ . We shall show that

(10) 
$$z \in \operatorname{conv} [\operatorname{dom} A]$$

Suppose to the contrary that

(11)  $z \notin \overline{\operatorname{conv}} [\operatorname{dom} A].$ 

Define  $B: X \rightrightarrows X^*$  by

(12) 
$$\operatorname{gra} B := \operatorname{gra} A - \{(0, z^*)\}.$$

Then we have

(13)  

$$F_B(z,0) = \sup_{(x,x^*)\in \text{gra }B} \left\{ \langle z, x^* \rangle - \langle x, x^* \rangle \right\}$$

$$= \sup_{(y,y^*)\in \text{gra }A} \left\{ \langle z, y^* - z^* \rangle - \langle y, y^* - z^* \rangle \right\}$$

$$= \sup_{(y,y^*)\in \text{gra }A} \left\{ \langle z, -z^* \rangle + \langle z, y^* \rangle + \langle y, z^* \rangle - \langle y, y^* \rangle \right\}$$

$$= \langle z, -z^* \rangle + F_A(z, z^*).$$

Since  $(z, z^*) \in \text{dom } F_A$ , by (13), there exists  $r \in \mathbb{R}$  such that

(14) 
$$F_B(z,0) \le r$$

By construction, B is maximally monotone and dom B = dom A. Then  $z \notin \overline{\text{conv}[\text{dom } B]}$  by (11). By the Separation theorem, there exist  $\delta > 0$  and  $y_0^* \in X^*$  with  $||y_0^*|| = 1$  such that

(15) 
$$\langle y_0^*, z - b \rangle > \delta, \quad \forall b \in \operatorname{conv} [\operatorname{dom} B].$$

Let  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . Since  $z \notin \overline{\text{conv}[\text{dom }B]}$ ,  $(z, ny_0^*) \notin \text{gra }B$ . By the maximal monotonicity of B, there exists  $(b_n, b_n^*) \in \text{gra }B$  such that

(16) 
$$\langle z - b_n, b_n^* \rangle + \langle ny_0^*, b_n \rangle > \langle ny_0^*, z \rangle \quad \Rightarrow \quad \langle z - b_n, b_n^* \rangle > \langle ny_0^*, z - b_n \rangle \Rightarrow \langle z - b_n, b_n^* \rangle > n\delta \quad (by (15)).$$

Then we have

$$F_B(z,0) \ge \sup_{n \in \mathbb{N}} \left\{ \langle z - b_n, b_n^* \rangle \right\}$$
$$\ge \sup_{n \in \mathbb{N}} \left\{ n\delta \right\}$$
$$= +\infty,$$

which contradicts (14). Hence  $z \in \overline{\text{conv} [\text{dom } A]}$  and in consequence (9) holds.

**Remark 3.7** As already noted Theorem 3.6 provides an affirmative answer to a question posed by Simons in [16, Problem 28.3, page 112].

**Question:** The following question is still unresolved:

Let  $A: X \rightrightarrows X^*$  be maximally monotone. Is  $\overline{\text{dom } A}$  necessarily convex? In light of Theorem 3.6 this is equivalent to asking if

$$\overline{\operatorname{dom} A} = \overline{P_X} \left[ \operatorname{dom} F_A \right]$$

always holds?

## Acknowledgment

Jonathan Borwein and Liangjin Yao were both partially supported by the Australian Research Council.

## References

- H.H. Bauschke, J.M. Borwein, X. Wang, and L. Yao, "Construction of pathological maximally monotone operators on non-reflexive Banach spaces", *Set Valued and Variational Analysis* in press; http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s11228-012-0209-0 or http://arxiv.org/abs/1108.1463.
- [2] H.H. Bauschke and P.L. Combettes, *Convex Analysis and Monotone Operator Theory* in *Hilbert Spaces*, Springer, 2011.
- [3] J.M. Borwein, "Maximal monotonicity via convex analysis", *Journal of Convex Analysis*, vol. 13, pp. 561–586, 2006.
- [4] J.M. Borwein, "Maximality of sums of two maximal monotone operators in general Banach space", Proceedings of the American Mathematical Society, vol. 135, pp. 3917– 3924, 2007.
- [5] J.M. Borwein, "Fifty years of maximal monotonicity", Optimization Letters, vol. 4, pp. 473–490, 2010.
- [6] J.M. Borwein and J.D. Vanderwerff, *Convex Functions*, Cambridge University Press, 2010.
- [7] R.S. Burachik and A.N. Iusem, *Set-Valued Mappings and Enlargements of Monotone Operators*, Springer, 2008.

- [8] S. Fitzpatrick, "Representing monotone operators by convex functions", in Workshop/Miniconference on Functional Analysis and Optimization (Canberra 1988), Proceedings of the Centre for Mathematical Analysis, Australian National University, vol. 20, Canberra, Australia, pp. 59–65, 1988.
- [9] M. Marques Alves and B.F. Svaiter, "Maximal monotone operators with a unique extension to the bidual", *Journal of Convex Analysis*, vol. 16, pp. 409–421, 2009
- [10] R.R. Phelps, Convex Functions, Monotone Operators and Differentiability, 2nd Edition, Springer-Verlag, 1993.
- [11] R.T. Rockafellar, "Local boundedness of nonlinear, monotone operators", Michigan Mathematical Journal, vol. 16, pp. 397–407, 1969.
- [12] R.T. Rockafellar, "On the maximality of sums of nonlinear monotone operators", Transactions of the American Mathematical Society, vol. 149, pp. 75–88, 1970.
- [13] R.T. Rockafellar and R.J-B Wets, Variational Analysis, 3nd Printing, Springer-Verlag, 2009.
- [14] S. Simons, *Minimax and Monotonicity*, Springer-Verlag, 1998.
- [15] S. Simons, "Dualized and scaled Fitzpatrick functions", Preceeding of the American Mathematical Society, vol. 134, pp. 2983–2987, 2006.
- [16] S. Simons, From Hahn-Banach to Monotonicity, Springer-Verlag, 2008.
- [17] S. Simons, "Maximal monotone multifunctions of Brøndsted-Rockafellar type", Set-Valued Analysis, vol. 7 pp. 255–294, 1999.
- [18] A. Verona and M.E. Verona, "Regular maximal monotone operators", Set-Valued Analysis, vol. 6, pp. 303–312, 1998.
- [19] A. Verona and M.E. Verona, "Regular maximal monotone operators and the sum theorem", Journal of Convex Analysis, vol. 7, pp. 115–128, 2000.
- [20] A. Verona and M.E. Verona, "Regularity and the Brøndsted-Rockafellar properties of maximal monotone operators", *Set-Valued Analysis*, vol. 14, pp. 149-157, 2006.
- [21] A. Verona and M.E. Verona, "Regular maximal monotone multifunctions and enlargements", Journal of Convex Analysis, vol. 16, pp. 1003–1009, 2009.
- [22] M.D. Voisei and C. Zălinescu, "Maximal monotonicity criteria for the composition and the sum under weak interiority conditions", *Mathematical Programming (Series B)*, vol. 123, pp. 265–283, 2010.

- [23] L. Yao, "The sum of a maximal monotone operator of type (FPV) and a maximal monotone operator with full domain is maximally monotone", *Nonlinear Analysis*, vol. 74, pp. 6144–6152, 2011.
- [24] L. Yao, On Monotone Linear Relations and the Sum Problem in Banach Spaces, Ph.D. thesis, Mathematics, University of British Columbia (Okanagan campus), 2011; http://hdl.handle.net/2429/39970.
- [25] L. Yao, "The sum of a maximally monotone linear relation and the subdifferential of a proper lower semicontinuous convex function is maximally monotone", *Set-Valued and Variational Analysis*, vol. 20, pp. 155–167, 2012.
- [26] C. Zălinescu, Convex Analysis in General Vector Spaces, World Scientific Publishing, 2002.
- [27] E. Zeidler, Nonlinear Functional Analysis and its Application, Vol II/A Linear Monotone Operators, Springer-Verlag, New York-Berlin-Heidelberg, 1990.
- [28] E. Zeidler, Nonlinear Functional Analysis and its Application II/B: Nonlinear Monotone Operators, Springer-Verlag, New York-Berlin-Heidelberg, 1990.